

1. THE TOUGH ONE.

We introduce the following notation. Suppose  $A$  is a statement and

$$\mathbf{free}(A) = \{x_{i_1}, \dots, x_{i_n}\}$$

where

$$i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_n$$

and suppose  $t_1, \dots, t_n$  are terms. We let

$$\overline{A}(t_1, \dots, t_n) = A_{x_{i_1} \rightarrow t_1, \dots, x_{i_n} \rightarrow t_n}.$$

We will frequently write

$$x \text{ for } (x_1, \dots, x_n).$$

Let

$$V = \{x_i : i \in \{1, \dots, n\}\}.$$

**Proposition 1.1.** Suppose  $N \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $N > 4$ . Let  $u$  be the term

$$(1 + (x_3 + 1) \cdot x_2)$$

and let  $Bt$  be the statement

$$\exists x_N ((x_1 = (u \cdot x_N) + x_4) \wedge (x_4 < u))$$

Then  $Bt$  strongly represents the Gödel  $\beta$ -function.

*Proof.* See p. 131 in Mendelson for the straightforward proof.  $\square$

Let us suppose that

- (i)  $g \in \mathbb{N}_1^n$  and  $g$  is represented by the statement  $A$ ;
- (ii)  $h \in \mathbb{N}_1^{n+2}$  and  $h$  is represented by the statement  $B$ ;
- (iii)  $f \in \mathbb{N}_1^{n+1}$ ,

$$f(x, 0) = g(x) \quad \text{for } x \in \mathbb{N}^n;$$

$$f(x, y + 1) = h(x, y, f(y)) \quad \text{for } (x, y) \in \mathbb{N}^{n+1};$$

Let  $Bt$  be as above with  $N$  there greater than  $n + 7$ . Let  $C_1, C_2, C_3, C_4$  be the statements

$$\exists x_{n+5} (\overline{Bt}(x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}, \overline{0}, x_{n+5}) \wedge \overline{A}(x, x_{n+5}))$$

$$\overline{Bt}(x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}, x_{n+1}, x_{n+2})$$

$$\overline{Bt}(x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}, x_{n+5}, x_{n+6}) \wedge \overline{Bt}(x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}, Sx_{n+5}, x_{n+6}) \wedge \overline{B}(x, x_{n+5}, x_{n+6}, x_{n+7})$$

$$\forall x_{n+5} ((x_{n+5} < x_{n+1}) \rightarrow \exists x_{n+6} \exists x_{n+7} C_3)$$

respectively. Note that

$$\mathbf{free}(A) = V \cup \{x_{n+1}\};$$

$$\mathbf{free}(B) = V \cup \{x_{n+1}, x_{n+2}, x_{n+3}\};$$

$$\mathbf{free}(C_1) = V \cup \{x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}\};$$

$$\mathbf{free}(C_2) = \{x_{n+1}, x_{n+2}, x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}\};$$

$$\mathbf{free}(C_3) = V \cup \{x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}, x_{n+5}, x_{n+6}, x_{n+7}\};$$

$$\mathbf{free}(C_4) = V \cup \{x_{n+1}, x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}\};$$

$$\mathbf{free}(C_1 \wedge C_2 \wedge C_4) = V \cup \{x_{n+1}, x_{n+2}, x_{n+3}, x_{n+4}\};$$

Let  $C$  be the statement

$$\exists x_{n+3} \exists x_{n+4} (C_1 \wedge C_2 \wedge C_4).$$

Note that

$$\mathbf{free}(C) = V \cup \{x_{n+1}, x_{n+2}\}.$$

**Theorem 1.1.**  $f$  is represented by  $C$ .

*Proof.* Suppose  $k \in \mathbb{N}^n$ ,  $p \in \mathbb{N}$  and

$$f(k, i) = r_i, \quad 0 \leq i \leq p.$$

Let  $\bar{k} = (\bar{k}_1, \dots, \bar{k}_n)$ . We will show that

$$(1) \quad \vdash \overline{C}(\bar{k}, \bar{p}, \bar{r}_p)$$

**Part One.** Suppose  $p = 0$ .

Choose  $b, c$  such that  $\beta(b, c, 0) = r_0$ . Then

$$\vdash \overline{Bt}(\bar{b}, \bar{c}, \bar{0}, \bar{r}_0) \quad \text{which is} \quad \vdash \overline{C_2}(\bar{0}, \bar{r}_0, \bar{b}, \bar{c})$$

Since  $g(k) = r_0$  we have

$$\vdash \overline{A}(\bar{k}, \bar{r}_0)$$

thus

$$\vdash \exists x_{n+1} (\overline{Bt}(\bar{b}, \bar{c}, \bar{0}, x_{n+1}) \wedge \overline{A}(\bar{k}, x_{n+1}))$$

which is

$$(2) \quad \vdash \overline{C_1}(\bar{k}, \bar{b}, \bar{c}).$$

Since  $\vdash \sim (x_{n+5} < \bar{0})$  we have

$$\vdash (x_{n+5} < \bar{0}) \rightarrow \exists x_{n+6} \exists x_{n+7} \overline{C_3}(\bar{k}, \bar{b}, \bar{c}, x_{n+5}, x_{n+6}, x_{n+7})$$

Applying **Gen** we obtain

$$\vdash \overline{C_4}(\bar{k}, \bar{0}, \bar{b}, \bar{c}).$$

Thus

$$\vdash \overline{C_1} \wedge \overline{C_2} \wedge \overline{C_4}(\bar{k}, \bar{0}, \bar{r}, \bar{b}, \bar{c})$$

which implies that (1) holds if  $p = 0$ .

**Part Two.** Suppose  $p > 0$ . Choose  $b, c \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$\beta(b, c, i) = r_i, \quad 0 \leq i \leq p.$$

This implies

$$(3) \quad \vdash \overline{Bt}(\bar{b}, \bar{c}, \bar{i}, \bar{r}_i) \quad \text{which implies} \quad \vdash \overline{C_2}(\bar{i}, \bar{r}_i, \bar{b}, \bar{c}) \quad \text{for } 0 \leq i \leq p.$$

Since

$$r_{i+1} = f(k, i+1) = h(k, i, f(k, i)) = h(k, i, r_i), \quad 0 \leq i < p,$$

and  $\overline{i+1} = S\bar{i}$  we have

$$\vdash \overline{Bt}(\bar{b}, \bar{c}, \bar{i}, \bar{r}_i) \wedge \overline{Bt}(\bar{b}, \bar{c}, S\bar{i}, \bar{r}_i) \wedge \overline{B}(\bar{k}, \bar{i}, \bar{r}_i, \bar{r}_{i+1}), \quad 0 \leq i < p.$$

which is

$$\vdash \overline{C_3}(\bar{k}, \bar{b}, \bar{c}, \bar{i}, \bar{r}_i, \bar{r}_{i+1}), \quad 0 \leq i < p.$$

This implies

$$\vdash \exists x_{n+6} \exists x_{n+7} \overline{C_3}(\bar{k}, \bar{b}, \bar{c}, \bar{i}, x_{n+6}, x_{n+7}), \quad 0 \leq i < p$$

We infer from a straightforward Proposition (3.8(b') in Mendelson) (or, even better, see Lemma 5 on page 291 of Hodel) that

$$(4) \quad \vdash \overline{C_4}(\bar{k}, \bar{p}, \bar{b}, \bar{c})$$

Taking the conjunction of (2), (3) and (4) we find that

$$\vdash \overline{C_1 \wedge C_2 \wedge C_4}(\overline{k}, \overline{p}, \overline{r_p}, \overline{b}, \overline{c})$$

which implies (1).

□